

DESIGN GUIDELINES

For Work Within Historic Districts

Mackinac Island Historic District Commission

City of Mackinac Island, Michigan

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1	rurį	rurpose		
П	Authority			
Ш	Design Considerations			
	A.	Historic Character of the Setting	2	
	В.	Historic Character of the Properties	4	
	C.	Historic Character of the Buildings	5	
IV	Design Guidelines			
	Definitions			
	Guidelines For Review			
	A.	Guidelines for Preservation / Maintenance of Historic Properties	9	
	В.	Guidelines for Rehabilitation/Renovation Historic Properties	11	
	C.	Guidelines for Additions to Historic Properties	15	
	D.	Guidelines for New Construction	16	
	E.	Guidelines for Utility Features	18	
	F.	Guidelines for Site Features	20	
		1. Fences	20	
Marl	ket and	Main (Huron) Historic District Map	23	
West	End H	istoric District Map	24	
Hubl	oard's A	Annex District Map	25	

I. PURPOSE

While historic districts are sometimes viewed as fossilized remains, in reality they are dynamic and evolving environments, not museum exhibits. As such, it is important to manage and guide inevitable change in order to retain the public purpose of having created the historic district to begin with. Renovation of existing historic buildings may occur to update structures to meet modern standards and incorporate new technology. It may be also possible to add new construction within the boundaries of historic districts both as additions and changes to existing buildings and as new buildings, if the design, density, and placement of the new construction respect the overall character of the building, site and district. These design guidelines are meant to assist in the management of change within the historic districts.

II. AUTHORITY

The Mackinac Island Historic District Commission (the HDC) is charged with applying the standards and guidelines of Section 11 of Ordinance No. 443, including the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards and guidelines, when evaluating an application for work within a historic district. Except as otherwise authorized by the Local Historic Districts Act, Public Act 169 of 1970, as amended, in the event there is a finding by the HDC that a guideline contained herein is in conflict with, or is not equivalent in guidance to, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and guidelines shall supersede.

III. DESIGN CONSIDERATIONS

A. HISTORIC CHARACTER OF THE SETTING:

The City of Mackinac Island oversees three historic districts, designated for their unique historic character.

The Hubbard's Annex Historic District is a 19th century platted neighborhood of irregular blocks in a grid of straight and curvilinear streets, set with well-spaced residential structures, many of which orient to a central community park. Properties along the southwest edge also orient to the magnificent views over the Straits of Mackinac. The architectural character is late 19th and early 20th century Queen Anne, Shingle, and Colonial Revival style designs. The landscape character is largely open and spacious, set with mature trees, but wooded areas, fences, and hedges are also found.

The West End Historic District is comprised predominantly of residential buildings on larger lots, although it does include some commercial uses. The visual character of the district is of two distinct types: long blocks of narrow streets fronted on both sides with small front yard setbacks, and one-sided blocks with large front yards having expansive views out to the Straits of Mackinac. This southwest edge is Main Street, whose curving layout is defined by the adjacent shoreline. The architectural character is a mix of Queen Anne, Shingle, and Colonial Revival style designs.

The Market and Main (Huron) Historic District includes two parallel streets on the shore of Haldimand Bay. The upper street, Market, contains a mix of commercial, institutional, and residential uses, most spaced apart, and most with small front yards. Some of the oldest remaining and most historic structures are located on Market Street. Main Street, set at a lower elevation closer to the shore, is comprised of densely built commercial buildings with no front and side setbacks, for the most part. The back, or southeast side, of these blocks face Haldimand Bay, making them second fronts, and very visible to everyone coming and going via the ferry traffic to and from the Island. The architectural character of the district is a mix of styles ranging from mid-19th century Italianate through early 20th century Neo-classical Revival styles. A unique aspect of this architecture is that it is largely still wood frame construction, as Mackinac Island never experienced the typical late 19th century evolution from frame to masonry construction, characterizing most American downtowns.

In reviewing proposed changes within the districts, considerations include:

- 1. Open Space and Out of Scale Buildings: Protecting the historic setting and context of properties, including the extent of open space and building mass, height, and density, should always be considered when planning new construction on a historic site or in a historic district. This entails identifying the formal or informal arrangements of buildings on the site. For example, a historic building traditionally surrounded by open space should not be crowded with dense or out-of-scale development.
- 2. <u>Landscape Features</u>: Historic landscapes and significant viewsheds should be preserved. Landscape features like fences, walls, walks, gardens, plant materials, statues, and open space can be significant parts of the building setting, even if such has not been specifically identified in and of itself as "historically contributing". These features may be important elements of framing views into or out of a property, and along entire blockscapes.
- 3. Waterfront Open Space: Open space, particularly along the waterfront side of Main Street, has been lost in recent years. Open space provides connectivity and preserves important views and visual relationships between the space of Main Street, the buildings on Main Street and the waters of Haldimand Bay. Haldimand Bay is historically significant. Historical and archaeological evidence suggests that the island's inhabitants have always clustered near Haldimand Bay. Due to the protected nature on the lee side of the Island, the

Bay has historically been the primary access point for Mackinac Island, and its natural harbor the reason for the laying out and settlement of the town in 1780. The Bay and its historic rock breakwall, together with the historic docks, extending into the Bay, should remain integrated into the downtown historic district and not be segregated visually from the downtown. In reviewing the height and mass of proposed new construction or additions along the water side of Main Street, consideration should be given to the impact on views and visual relationships from Main Street, including from the northwest side of Main Street, and from the water to Main Street.

4. Preserving Relationship between Buildings: Within the district, the historic relationships between buildings should be protected. Contributing buildings and public ways including walks, streets and parks, should not be isolated from one another by the insertion of new construction. The historic buildings and the elements of the setting should remain predominant and the district's historic character should be retained.

B. HISTORIC CHARACTER OF THE PROPERTIES:

Each property is comprised of varying mixes of components including buildings, open space, fences, walls, plant materials, and landscape features. Each property within a historic district is an integral part of the larger whole. An effect to one, is an effect to all.

- 1. <u>Historic Function</u>: A property's historic function should be evident even if there is a change of use.
- 2. <u>Viewed as a Whole</u>: Property should be viewed as a whole. For example, open space around a building is generally part of the setting of a historic building.
- 3. <u>Compatibility of New Construction</u>: Property which contains historically contributing structures should be evaluated and a determination made whether such proposed new construction is compatible with the historic character of the property and its setting as a whole, including open space, views, and connectivity.
- 4. <u>New Construction</u>: Related new construction including buildings, landscape improvements and other new features should not alter the significant historic character of a property.
- 5. <u>Locating New Construction in the Setting</u>: The location of new construction should be considered carefully in order to respect the setbacks of historic buildings and to avoid blocking their primary elevations and views.

6. <u>Locating New Construction in Proximity to a Historic Building</u>: New construction should be placed away from or at the side or rear of historic buildings and should avoid obscuring, damaging, or destroying character-defining features of these buildings or the site or the district.

C. HISTORIC CHARACTER OF THE BUILDINGS:

The architectural significance of each building is made up of numerous characteristics which define each. When taken together, the unique appearance of each building is determined. Maintaining these, or at least a predominance of these, insures preservation of the resource.

- 1. <u>Massing, Size, Scale</u>: As with new additions, the massing, size, scale, and architectural features of new construction on the site of a historic building(s) or within a historic district should be compatible with those of the historic building(s) in the district.
- 2. <u>Surrounding Buildings</u>: When visible and in close proximity to other resources the new construction should respect its immediate surroundings and setting and should be subordinate to historic buildings; and respect the scale and design characteristics of nearby resources.
- 3. Monolithic Building Height: In certain areas on Main Street building heights have become monolithic at the maximum allowable building height under the Zoning Ordinance of 3 stories (40 feet). Building facades less than 3 stories in height should be preserved to maintain diversity in building heights to maintain the historic appearance of the downtown. Additions to the height of buildings should be carefully accomplished to avoid diminishing the variety of building heights.
- 4. <u>Floor Lines</u>: Floor lines of new building and additions should be in harmony with neighboring building floor lines and not be disproportionally out of line.
- Preservation of Building Materials: When proposed work will impact the
 physical integrity of a historic structure the destruction of historic materials
 should be avoided or minimized.
- 6. <u>Replication</u>: Except when a historic building has been properly documented and the documentation enables replication, new construction should be distinct from the old and should not attempt to replicate historic buildings elsewhere, to avoid creating a false sense of historic development.
- 7. <u>Differentiating New from Old</u>: The new work should be differentiated from the old but still be compatible with and subordinate to massing, size, scale, and architectural features.

- a. New additions should always be subordinate to the historic building. They should not compete in size, scale, massing or design with the historic building. The location and its impact upon historic façades of a building (front, side, or back) should be considered. Typically the rear of a building will have less impact upon the historic quality and character of the existing building. The standards of The Secretary of The Interior's Preservation Brief No. 14 shall also be taken into consideration (see Design Guidelines for Additions to Historic Properties below).
- b. Where the new work would require demolition of all or a portion of a resource, the HDC will, before the application for an addition or new construction is considered, consider whether the demolition should be approved under the criteria set forth in Section14(D) of Ordinance No. 443. Demolition does not include Alterations or Repairs as defined below.
- c. Use building materials in the same color range and that are harmonious with the historic building.
- 8. <u>Rooftop Additions</u>: In addition to the applicable guidelines above, the following additional guidelines apply:
 - a. Generally, a rooftop addition should not exceed one story. But an addition of more than one story may be considered compatible if it is adjacent to similarly sized or taller buildings, while still maintaining diversity in rooflines.
 - b. The addition should be recessed behind the front façade of the historic building
 - c. Sight lines from streets: New rooftop additions should be minimally visible. In evaluating applications for new additions, various devices such as helium balloons, flagpoles and flags can be used to mark the location, height, and width of the proposed addition to assess its visibility. Consideration must be given to the appearance of a rooftop addition from Haldimand Bay.

IV. DESIGN GUIDELINES

The following architectural guidelines for design review are intended to assist the applicant and the Commission in reviewing the architectural characteristics of plans for work within the historic districts. Note that compliance with the design guidelines does not necessarily mean the proposed work meets the requirements of Section 11 of Ordinance No. 443.

Design guidelines are necessarily general basic principles, not specific dos and don'ts, as every historic building is different and each project is unique. The guidelines are general so as to apply to a wide variety of building types and situations.

Definitions.

The following definitions shall apply for purposes of these guidelines only.

- 1. Commercial structures shall mean buildings and structures used for solely commercial purposes, mixed commercial and residential purposes, or institutional purposes, or used as hotels, churches or places of worship.
- 2. Noncommercial structures shall mean all other buildings and structures including, but not limited to, single-family residences, duplexes, multifamily residential dwellings (apartments), bed and breakfast establishments, boardinghouses, and associated accessory buildings.
- 3. Alteration: Work that changes the detail of a resource but does not change its basic size or shape. Alteration is "work" requiring a certificate of appropriateness from the HDC. An alteration (e.g. replacing a rotted fence with "like for like"; replacing a wood window in the same opening with a wood window that is "like for like"; replacing a porch with "like for like"), is not demolition.
- 4. Repair: is as defined in Section 3, Ordinance No. 443. A repair is not demolition.
- 5. Those definitions as contained in Ordinance No. 443 shall be applicable in applying these guidelines except as further clarified herein. The terms construction, new construction, and additions are used interchangeably in these guidelines.

Guidelines for review.

In reviewing the architectural design of projects, consideration should be given to the design considerations, the architectural exterior features, heights, appearance, color and texture of the materials of exterior construction and the placement of the structure on the lot such that the same are congruous and in harmony with those of the structures within and contiguous to the historic district in which the property is located and the historical character of the island, and further that the structure would not be unsightly, grotesque or detrimental to the stability of the value and welfare of the surrounding property, structures, residences and to the general and economic welfare and happiness of the community as a whole. If any portion of the design guidelines as set forth herein is contrary to the requirements of Section 11 of Ordinance No. 443, then that portion of the design guidelines shall not apply.

The following entitled five sets of Design Guidelines are lists of architectural review topics that shall be applied when considering a building project for a certificate of

appropriateness. The purpose of these guidelines is to ensure that any building work will be harmonious to its historic district and to the historic character of Mackinac Island. It is recognized that Mackinac Island has several unique historic districts, each with a distinct architectural character, which are important to preserve for future generations to appreciate, enjoy and foster. In addition, all design, materials, and construction shall satisfy appropriate State of Michigan construction codes adopted by the City of Mackinac Island.

Where proposed work is compatible with the architectural style of existing buildings in the immediate area of the subject property, the Historic District Commission may modify or disregard certain guidelines outlined below, which may otherwise be incompatible with existing buildings, provided that any such modification is in keeping with the intent of the requirements of Section 11 of Ordinance No. 443, and that such modification will result in an architectural design which is more compatible with the historic character of the historic district and Mackinac Island as a whole.

A. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR PRESERVATION / MAINTENANCE OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES

1. <u>Foundations</u>. Preserve existing stone foundations by maintenance and repair (such as pointing of mortar joints), rather than replacing with non-original materials such as concrete block or poured concrete.

Match original mortar color when pointing historic masonry. Use a mortar type which is softer than the stone or brick being pointed.

2. Walls. Where feasible, preserve existing historic wood siding, trim, and decorative details rather than replacing with inappropriately dimensioned new larger exposure siding, or with inappropriate materials. Where historic wall materials are too deteriorated to be preserved, replacements should match historic dimensions, profiles and details.

Maintain historic painted surfaces by removing loose and defective paint, prime painting of bare wood, and finish painting with two coats.

3. <u>Windows</u>. Preserve original or historic wood windows through maintenance and energy-efficient retro-fitting with weather-stripping and storm windows.

Maintain historic wood storm windows where they exist.

Retain old glass with its unique irregularities and distortions.

Maintain muntin divisions of sashes, where they exist.

Maintain glazing by replacing putty when it loosens or falls out.

Maintain protective painted finish on wood windows.

For year-around (i.e. heated) buildings, upgrade energy inefficient old windows by adding weather stripping, and by adding storm windows if none exist. Exterior storms are usually the best as they provide protection for the historic windows, although sometimes interior storm windows are appropriate. Install new storm windows of traditional wood type or of aluminum type designed for historic windows.

4. <u>Doors</u>. Preserve original or historic wood doors through maintenance and energy-efficient retro-fitting, with weather-stripping and storm doors.

Maintain historic wood storm and screen doors where they exist.

For doors with glazing, retain old glass with its unique irregularities and distortions. Maintain glazing by replacing deteriorated putty or stops.

Maintain protective painted or transparent finish on doors.

For year-around (i.e. heated) buildings, upgrade energy efficiency of old doors by adding weather stripping, and by adding storm doors if none exist. (same comment as above in #3)

Storm doors, if appropriate, should minimize their visual impact on the building's appearance. Storm door design should be compatible with the architectural character of the building and of the primary door. The glazing size and shape, and the door color, should enhance its compatibility with the historic door. New storm doors should be traditional wood type or compatible aluminum type.

5. Porches. Retain historic porches.

Maintain old wood porch flooring with regular repainting.

Maintain columns, railings, and any decorative woodwork.

Depending on the column type and style, cut out deteriorated wood and splice in replacement pieces, rather than replace the entire column.

6. Roofs. Retain appropriate historic primary roof form, covered with unit type roofing materials, or metal if that is historic.

Since roofing materials have definitive / specific life spans, roofing must be periodically replaced. Failing roofing should be replaced with new material that matches what was on the building historically, or which best approximates it. Dimensional or layered asphalt shingles with vertical divisions are an acceptable substitute for wood shingles.

- Chimneys. Preserve and maintain original and historic chimneys. While some historic architectural styles emphasized chimneys more than others, in our age of chimney-less venting technology, all chimneys are important historic character elements.
- 8. <u>Colors</u>. Paint and material colors shall be in keeping with / compatible with surrounding buildings, and appropriate to the historic style or development period of the building. In any case, neon, fluorescent, phosphorescent, or iridescent, or other non-traditional colors are prohibited.

B. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR REHABILITATION / RENOVATION OF HISTORIC PROPERTIES

- a. <u>Foundations</u>. When existing stone foundations must be rebuilt, match the character of the original stonework.
- b. <u>Walls</u>. When original wood siding must be replaced, use a board width that results in an exposure dimension within one inch, plus or minus, of historic siding.

Acceptable substitute materials to replicate the appearance of painted wood siding and trim are: fiber cement, cellular PVC, and poly-ash siding and trim products, as approved by the HDC. Substitute materials, even if not required by the manufacturer to be painted, shall receive at least one finish coat after installation.

For commercial structures, the surfaces of all exterior walls accessible to the public, or exposed to public view, shall be clad in wood siding and trim.

c. Windows. If replacement is necessary, new windows shall match the type, size, and design characteristics appropriate to the architectural character of the building. Replacement windows should match original materials (i.e. wood for wood), particularly if not all windows in the building are being replaced. And they should include significant design features such as muntins, if such exist on the old windows.

If all windows are being replaced, acceptable substitute exterior window cladding materials are aluminum, fiberglass, or vinyl, if the components and details of the new windows generally match those of the originals, particularly replication of the angled putty glazing.

Moving or adding windows is allowed, but the result must maintain an appropriate historic placement and number of windows as was typical.

The maximum glass area of any exterior wall is 50% percent. A minimum of 70 % of the individual window units shall be either single-hung or double-hung, or double-hung in appearance.

For commercial structures, window sills shall be a minimum of 18" above the exterior walking surface and the head of the window shall be at least 8 feet above.

For commercial structures, windows for display purposes located on the ground floor street level should be trimmed in wood, or approved substitute material, with a minimum width of 3 ½".

Winter shuttering of windows should be done in a manner so as to minimally detract from the appearance of the building. Shuttering should coincide with the Mackinac Island State Park schedule, meaning no openings should be shuttered prior to the end of October.

Mirrored or dark tinted glass with a visible light transmittance of less than 60 percent shall not be allowed.

These guidelines for "windows" shall not apply to approved attached or detached greenhouse type structures.

d. <u>Doors</u>. If replacement is necessary, new doors shall match the type, size, and design characteristics appropriate to the architectural character of the building. Replacement doors should match original materials (i.e. wood for wood).

Details of new doors shall generally match those of the originals, particularly replication of raised panels and glazing beads.

Doors shall be hinged type, or at a minimum shall look like hinged doors. On residential and residential accessory structures, sliding doors shall be allowed if they appear to be French style hinged doors. Roll-up or tilt-up type garage doors shall not be allowed.

Moving or adding doors is allowed, but the result must maintain an appropriate historic placement and number.

Mirrored or dark tinted glass with a visible light transmittance of less than 60 percent shall not be allowed.

If replacement is necessary, new doors shall be appropriate to the architectural character of the building, which minimally includes being hinged (not sliding) type, and being stile and rail panel type doors (as opposed to flush type doors).

For commercial structures sited on the front property live, entryways shall be recessed into the front building wall.

Winter shuttering of doors and erection of weather-break enclosures shall be done in a manner so as to minimally detract from the appearance of the building.

e. <u>Roofs.</u> All roofs shall be consistent with the types and appearance of those on surrounding buildings.

For residential structures the minimum pitch for the main portion of the roof shall be 6 vertical and 12 horizontal. Roof coverings for the main portion of the roof shall have an individual unit shingled appearance, and be of materials such as wood, asphalt/ fiberglass, or metal. If determined appropriate, ribbed or standing seam metal roofs may be allowed.

f. Porches. Front porches or stoops shall be maintained where they exist.

Porches shall be of the appropriate historic proportions and configurations, at characteristic locations on buildings. Size increase or decrease is allowable if an overall appropriate appearance is maintained.

If original columns are to be replaced, install new columns that match. If non-original columns are to be replaced, consider installing new columns that duplicate the original ones, based on historic documentation. If not matching the original design, replacement columns shall be of a style and size appropriate to the building.

Original and/or historic railings should be repaired rather than replaced, in order to preserve them at their characteristic less than building code allowed height, where possible under the building and rehabilitation codes. Any increase in railing height when required should be done in a manner that preserves the overall appearance of the original railing height.

The addition of new railings should be accomplished so as not to detract from the appearance of the building.

- g. Overhangs. In commercial areas, overhangs, canopies, and projecting elements extending over the public right of way shall have prior municipal approval by the City Council. All such elements shall be compatible with the architecture of the building. No access to the roof of an overhang, canopy, or the like will be allowed.
- h. Awnings. Awnings shall be appropriate to the style period and architecture of the building, being traditional shed or sloped type found historically. No backlit awnings shall be allowed. The City of Mackinac Island Sign Ordinance (Ordinance No. 351, as amended) shall be followed for lettering design. Colors shall meet the guideline set forth in the following paragraph.
- Colors. Paint and material colors shall be in keeping with / compatible
 with surrounding buildings, and appropriate to the historic style or
 development period of the building. In any case, neon, fluorescent,
 phosphorescent or iridescent, or other non-traditional colors are
 prohibited.
- j. <u>Utility Features</u>. Utility features such as venting, heating, ventilating, and air-conditioning, satellite dishes, solar systems, propane tanks, automatic

teller machines, vending machines, and trash receptacles etc. shall be located so as to be disguised or shielded from view, and muffled in sound so as to suppress noise levels. No window-mounted air conditioning units shall be allowed.

- k. <u>Lighting</u>. Exterior fixtures and lighting, as well as interior lighting intended to be viewed from the outside, shall be appropriate to the architecture of the building, and to the historic nature of the district. Architectural outlining, flashing, strobe, neon or the like shall not be allowed.
- 1. <u>Accessory Structures</u>. Original and/or historic outbuildings, such as sheds, gazebos, pergolas, etc. shall be preserved.

C. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR ADDITIONS TO HISTORIC PROPERTIES

According to the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation – Standard 9 in particular – and the Guidelines for Rehabilitating Historic Buildings, new construction needs to be built in a manner that protects the integrity of the historic building(s) and the property's setting.

The following are as distilled from Preservation Brief No.14 "New Exterior Additions to Historic Buildings: Preservation Concerns" by Grimmer and Weeks, National Park Service, August 2010.

New additions to historic buildings and new construction within a historic district should preserve the character of the buildings and the integrity of the district. They should:

- Preserve significant form, features, and materials of the historic building;
- Be compatible;
- Reference or reflect, but not copy, the historic building, through the use of the same materials, and through a simplified design or version of the original;
- Be differentiated from the old;
- Be subordinate in size and/or design;
- Be appropriately scaled usually smaller in proportion, and possibly attached by a smaller connector;
- Use simplified architectural features as are on the historic building;
- Employ materials and colors that are harmonious with the historic building;
- Minimize the loss of, or damage to, significant details and materials;
- Be carefully placed or located for minimal impact on the historic building and the site and the surrounding district.

D. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR NEW CONSTRUCTION

- 1. <u>Foundations</u>. Foundation materials should in some way be treated (painted, parged, stuccoed or otherwise detailed) to provide a finished appearance, or should be constructed with natural and synthetic stone of a type native to, or characteristic of, the Great Lakes basin.
- 2. Walls. The majority of all exterior wall surfaces should be covered with materials that provide the appearance of wood shingles, horizontal lap siding, vertical board and batten siding, or natural stone native to the Great Lakes basin. Accent panels and window or door trim may be of any material. Log exteriors may be appropriate where consistent or congruous with the character of the surrounding neighborhood.
- 3. <u>Windows</u>. The maximum glass area for any exterior wall surface (excluding approved attached or detached greenhouse type structures and fully enclosed porches) should be 50 percent. A minimum of 70 percent of the individual window units should be either single hung or double hung type, or double hung in appearance.

Mirrored or dark tinted glass with visible light transmittance of less than 60 percent should not be allowed.

Windows should be trimmed in wood or like material with a minimum trim width of 3-1/2 inches.

For commercial structures, window sills should be a minimum of 18" above the exterior walking surface, and the head of the window at least 8 feet, but not more than 12 feet, above the walking surface.

4. <u>Doors</u>. Doors should be hinged type, or at a minimum should look like hinged doors. Horizontally operating sliding doors should be allowed if they appear to be hinged type. Roll-up or tilt-up style garage doors are not allowed.

For commercial structures, entryways of buildings with no front setbacks should be recessed into the building front wall. No sliding, revolving, roll-up, tilt-up or overhead garage style doors shall be allowed.

5. Roofs: Roofs should be in keeping with the roofs of surrounding buildings. The minimum pitch for the primary portion of the roof should be 6 vertical and 12 horizontal. Roof coverings for the main portion of the roof should have an individual unit / shingled appearance, and be of materials such as wood or dimensional asphalt/ fiberglass. Standing seam or ribbed metal roofs may also be allowed, as determined appropriate by the HDC.

Secondary sloped roofs may be lower-sloped, and may have a membrane type covering system.

For commercial structures, roofs should be consistent with the types and appearance of those on surrounding architecture. Overhangs, canopies, and projecting elements extending over the public right of way shall have prior municipal approval by the City Council. All such elements should be compatible with the architecture of the building. No access to the roof of an overhang, canopy, or the like will be allowed.

- 6. <u>Porches</u>. Front porches or stoops, when provided, should be covered with a roof that is compatible with, but does not necessarily match, the main roof.
 - Porches should be of the appropriate historic proportions and configurations, at characteristic locations on buildings.
- 7. Awnings. If used, awnings should be appropriate to the style period and architecture of the building, being traditional shed or sloped type found historically. No backlit awnings shall be allowed. The City of Mackinac Island Sign Ordinance (Ordinance No. 351, as amended) shall be followed for lettering design. Colors shall meet the guideline set forth in the following paragraph.
- 8. <u>Colors</u>. Paint and material colors should be in keeping with / compatible with surrounding buildings, and appropriate to the historic style or development period of the building. In any case, neon, fluorescent, phosphorescent or iridescent, or other non-traditional colors are prohibited.
- 9. <u>Monotony of design</u>. For new construction or additions involving multiple units, monotony of design should be avoided. Variation of siting, form, rhythm, and detailing should be used to provide visual interest.

E. DESIGN GUIDELINES FOR UTILITY FEATURES

Solar Systems. The application of materials which will adversely alter the
original roof line and/or physical character of designated historic structures or
alter the physical character of other resources within designated historic
districts is discouraged. Owners of historic properties should explore
alternative means of conserving energy before considering the use and
installation of solar systems.

Where owners apply to install solar systems to the structure or other resources within a historic district the Commission will evaluate each application on its merits. Factors which will be considered include the following:

- a. The location and size of the solar system, the historic character and architectural importance of the structure and surrounding environment; and the impact upon the historic character of resources in the immediate area and the district as a whole;
- b. The intended purpose of the installation;
- c. Other alternative means explored for conserving energy, and the reasons for their rejection;
- d. The visibility of the solar system from adjacent public streets, the water and adjoining properties.

2. Propane Tanks:

- a. Placement of propane tanks (defined as 20 pounds capacity or larger) shall require review by the HDC. Such tanks and placement shall also comply with all state and local regulatory requirements, including the Michigan Mechanical Code ("State and Local Regulations").
- b. Propane tanks should be located so they are not visible from the street. They should be located at the rear of buildings unless such location creates greater visibility from another street.
- c. If an unobtrusive location cannot be found on the property, and be in compliance with State and Local Regulations, then the following alternatives may be considered:
 - (i) Propane tanks should not be located in front yards.
 - (ii) If in side yards, tanks should be screened with plant material, lattice, fencing, or such other screening as is historically compatible, so long as the propane tank is in compliance with State and Local Regulations.

(iii) Placement and screening of propane tanks on vacant lots shall be reviewed on a case-by-case basis with the objective of minimizing the appearance of a tank installation from the street.

F. GUIDELINES FOR SITE FEATURES

1. Fences

a. Location:

- Fences must be located on the property of the party erecting the fence.
- No fences or walls may be placed in the public right of way.
- Common fences located on a property line are acceptable, but with the written permission of the neighboring property owner.
- Clear vision near drives, sidewalks and streets may be maintained for safety.
- Fences in front yards shall not infringe upon site vistas, panoramas, or streetscapes.
- Fences should define site patterns and historic lot patterns, as opposed to placement along arbitrary lines.

b. Design:

- Fences should be visually compatible with the site, including site patterns and vistas.
- Retain the historic relationship between buildings, landscape features, and open space.
- The design of fences and walls should be compatible with the architecture of the main building on the property, through the use of similar materials, design motifs, colors, etc.
- Lacking historical documentation, fence designs should lean toward simplicity rather than being overly ornate.
- The size and scale of fencing should be appropriate to the historic setting.
- Where fences are not documented historically, consider alternative means of separation such as plant materials, planted as a hedge or more informally as a screen.
- The finished side of a fence shall face outward from the property it is on.
- Any necessary bracing shall be on the inside of the fence.
- Gates shall swing into the property being fenced or walled.
- Front yard fences should be an open design such as cast iron, picket, post and rail, or split rail, however they should not be chain-link type. Chain-link may be used in side and rear yards.
- Sight obscuring fences such as solid board type should not be used in front yards.
- Fences in rear yards, where visibility from the street is limited, often are more appropriate for privacy, pet control, and security.

c. Inappropriate / Prohibited Types:

• Barbed wire, razor wire, concertina wire, or other hazardous type.

- Single-strand wire.
- Chicken wire.
- Chain link with wood or plastic slats.
- Chain link vinyl coated, except black, brown, or dark green are allowed.
- Electric, except animal containment fences and invisible pet fences are allowed.
- Chain link in front yards.
- Sight obscuring fences in front yards.
- Concrete block walls.

d. Height:

- Fences and walls in front yards should be no higher than 4 feet tall, except at entries for decorative gateways or trellises, which may extend as high as 10 feet.
- In side and rear yards fences should be no higher than 6 feet tall.
- Fences around recreational amenities such as tennis courts, swimming pools, and hot tubs/spas shall be exempt from a height limitation.

e. Materials:

- Fences and walls should be constructed of materials indigenous to the Island (i.e. wood and stone), or which are historically appropriate on the Island (i.e. cast iron and woven wire).
- Less appropriate materials are plastic, vinyl, and aluminum.
- No more than two materials should be used in a single fence.
- Orange plastic, snow, cyclone, silt control, or other similar fencing may be used seasonally or temporarily, but may be restricted as to location and length of use.

f. Colors:

- If constructed of natural materials, colors should reflect the inherent nature of the materials used, such as native stone or weathered wood.
- Painted or stained fences should be of natural colors like brown, grey, green, or black, or historically appropriate colors such as white.
- Iridescent or day-glow colors are not allowed, except for temporary or seasonal fencing.

g. Maintenance:

- Protect and maintain historic fences and walls.
- Repair rather than replace historic fences and walls.
- Fences and walls shall be maintained in structurally sound, plumb (vertically upright), and intact condition.
- Missing or warped pickets, slats, or boards shall be replaced when needed to be. Damaged or deteriorated fences or walls shall be

repaired in a reasonable time period (within 30 days during the summer season) with materials of similar type and quality.

h. Commercial Fences:

- The same guidelines shall apply for commercial fences as for residential fence installations and locations.
- Trash shall be screened by a 6 feet high fence where a commercial property abuts a residential property.
- Fences over 6 feet high for screening equipment in commercial areas may be allowed, or required.

.







